

Dependent Origination: Seeing the Dharma

Week Six: Interconnectedness and Interpenetration

Experiential Homework Possibilities

The experiential homework is essentially the first exercise we practiced in class involving looking for the boundary between oneself and other than self while experiencing seeing. This is the exercise my dissertation subjects were given for my data collection portion of my dissertation research. It relates directly to the transition from the link of nama-rupa to the link of vinnana, and then sankhara, that I spoke about in my talk this week. Just so that you can begin to have some experiential relationship to my research before I present my dissertation in our last session in two weeks, I'm including the exact instructions as they were given to my participants as well as the daily journal questionnaire they were asked to fill out. Exercises like these are meant not as onetime exercises but for repeated application. Your experience of them will often change and deepen if they are applied regularly over an extended period of time. My subjects used this exercise as part of their daily meditation practice for 15 minutes a day over a period of 10 days. Each day they filled out the questionnaire, their answers to which then became a significant part of my data. See below.

Suggested Reading

“Subtle Energy” This reading is a selection of excerpts from my dissertation Literature Review regarding the topic of subtle energy. See below.

Transcendental Dependent Origination by Bhikkhu Bodhi. This is a sutta selection translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi with his commentary. While the ordinary form of Dependent Origination describes the causes and conditions that lead to suffering, in this version, the Buddha also enumerates the chain of causes and conditions that lead to the end of suffering. <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/bodhi/wheel277.html>

Selection from the Kevatta Sutta, translated by Ajahn Thanissaro, on the topic of consciousness that is featureless and “all-around.” With further notes by me. See below.

Selection from *Small Boat, Great Mountain: Theravadan Reflections on the Natural Great Perfection*, by Ajahn Amaro. This book is another one of those published for free distribution so not available online. But you can get a copy by going to Abhayagiri Monastery. Ajahn Amaro used to be the co-abbot of Abhayagiri Monastery along with Ajahn Passano. He is now Ajahn Sumedho's successor as the abbot of Amaravati Monastery in England and the head of the Ajahn Cha lineage of Western monks. This book is a transcription of talks he gave at a retreat at Spirit Rock which he co-taught with Tsoknyi Rinpoche. Selection from the book <http://www.seattleinsight.org/Portals/0/Documents/Study%20Materials/Small-BoatGreat-Mountain-excerpt-Ajahn-Amaro.pdf>

Full text of the book

http://www.media.abhayagiri.org/books/amaro_small_boat_great_mountain.pdf

“World As Lover, World As Self,” by Joanna Macy. This is a chapter from Macy’s book by the same title.

Joanna Macy, “The Greening of the Self,” in *World as Lover, World as Self*.

<http://www.dhushara.com/book/budd/mht/green.htm>

“Dogen’s Cosmology of Space and the Practice of Self-Fulfillment.” By Taigen Dan Leighton, teacher at Ancient Dragon Zen Gate in Chicago.

http://www.ancientdragon.org/dharma/articles/dogens_cosmology_of_space

“Wild Time: Commentaries on Dogen Zenji’s *Being Time*,” by Ven. Anzan Hoshin, Roshi, <http://www.wzwc.org/book/wild-time-commentaries-dogen-zenjis-being-time>

MINDFUL EXPLORATION EXERCISE AND REPORTING PROTOCOL

Protocol

Thank you for your willingness to participate in this dissertation research.

My Research Focus: I am particularly interested in the relationship between various ways that consciousness is structured. OR I am exploring the subtle structure of consciousness. In order to do this I have recruited a small group of experienced meditators, including yourself, who will use a mindfulness exercise designed to facilitate this exploration and report on their experience.

Scheduling Your Formal Practice: As a participant, you will practice this exercise each day for a period of ten days. During this time, as part of your daily meditation practice, I ask that you spend 15 minutes per day using a mindful investigation which I will describe below.

Daily Journal: After your daily formal 15 minute exploration of the exercise, take a few minutes to sit down at your computer to record anything noteworthy that occurred for you during the day's exercise using the *Daily Journal* form that I have provided. Each *Daily Journal* entry provides space for the following:

- your experience of the particular meditative investigation I describe,
- new avenues of investigation that you pursued,
- insights or areas of curiosity that have arisen,
- any emotions evoked by the practice,
- any images evoked by the practice,
- any significant bodily sensations evoked by the practice,
- any experiences you would describe as subtle energy experiences, and
- any shifts in perception that occurred.

Use your judgment to decide what is most significant to you to include. If you have nothing to report for a particular category just enter "None."

New Avenues of Investigation: While the main focus of this research is the mindful exploration exercise described below, as an experienced meditator this exercise may catalyze new directions of investigation you are moved to explore. Feel free to follow those leads as they arise while also continuing to practice the main exercise as the primary focus of your 15 minute session.

Mindful Exploration Exercise

Visual Object

This exercise explores the experience of seeing. As an aid in your meditation you will choose an object to be the focus of your seeing during those parts of the exercise which require a visual focus. For this object, choose something small, roughly 1"- 2" tall and 1"- 2" wide. Your object should be emotionally neutral and simple in form. Place your object about 4 feet in front of you, preferably at about eye level as you sit in your meditation posture.

Mindful Exploration Exercise

(I suggest re-reading the following brief paragraph before each day's session.)

In your usual sitting posture, meditate with your eyes open. In this exercise you will be examining the experience of seeing. Focus your sight specifically on your chosen visual object. While holding your focus on your visual object, try to find in your direct, present moment experience the boundary between yourself as the knower and that which is seen. Where do 'you' as the knower end? Where does the visual field begin? If you experience a boundary, what is it that communicates to you its presence? What happens when you include a mindfulness of that boundary in your experience of seeing? Does the boundary remain stable or does it change? If it changes how does it change? Or perhaps you find that there is no boundary. What is *your* direct experience? What impact does your exploration have on you? Continue with this exploration for 15 minutes, taking brief breaks to relax your posture and refocus your visual attention as is useful for you.

Meditation Journal

At the end of the session, take a few minutes to fill out the *Daily Journal* form about your experience of the exercise for this day and e-mail the completed form to me.

The following is the conclusion of a long Sutta from the *Digha Nikaya* Ajahn Thanissaro that focuses on what is left when consciousness is no longer structured. In this sutta one of the Buddha's monks takes a deep Dharma question to the gods of various heavenly abodes. Of course, we could interpret this aspect of the story line literally or metaphorically. The main point is that it was only when the Buddha himself was asked did the monk get an answer to his question.

DN 11
PTS: [Di 211](#)

Kevatta (Kevaddha) Sutta: To Kevatta

translated from the Pali by

Thanissaro Bhikkhu

© 1997–2012

Conversations with the Gods

"Once, Kevatta, this train of thought arose in the awareness of a certain monk in this very community of monks: 'Where do these four great elements — the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property — cease without remainder?' Then he attained to such a state of concentration that the way leading to the gods appeared in his centered mind. So he approached the gods of the retinue of the Four Great Kings and, on arrival, asked them, 'Friends, where do these four great elements — the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property — cease without remainder?'

"When this was said, the gods of the retinue of the Four Great Kings said to the monk, 'We also don't know where the four great elements... cease without remainder. But there are the Four Great Kings who are higher and more sublime than we. They should know where the four great elements... cease without remainder.'

"So the monk approached the Four Great Kings and, on arrival, asked them, 'Friends, where do these four great elements... cease without remainder?'

"When this was said, the Four Great Kings said to the monk, 'We also don't know where the four great elements... cease without remainder. But there are the gods of the Thirty-three who are higher and more sublime than we. They should know...'

"So the monk approached the gods of the Thirty-three and, on arrival, asked them, 'Friends, where do these four great elements... cease without remainder?'

"When this was said, the gods of the Thirty-three said to the monk, 'We also don't know where the four great elements... cease without remainder. But there is Sakka, the ruler of the gods, who is higher and more sublime than we. He should know...'

"So the monk approached Sakka, the ruler of the gods, and, on arrival, asked him, 'Friend, where do these four great elements... cease without remainder?'

"When this was said, Sakka, the ruler of the gods, said to the monk, 'I also don't know where the four great elements... cease without remainder. But there are the Yama gods who are higher and more sublime than I. They should know...!...'

"The Yama gods said, 'We also don't know... But there is the god named Suyama... He should know...!...'

"Suyama said, 'I also don't know... But there is the god named Santusita... He should know...!...'

"Santusita said, 'I also don't know... But there are the Nimmanarati gods... They should know...!...'

"The Nimmanarati gods said, 'We also don't know... But there is the god named Sunimmita... He should know...!...'

"Sunimmita said, 'I also don't know... But there are the Paranimmitavasavatti gods... They should know...!...'

"The Paranimmitavasavatti gods said, 'We also don't know... But there is the god named Paranimmita Vasavatti... He should know...!...'

"So the monk approached the god Vasavatti and, on arrival, asked him, 'Friend, where do these four great elements... cease without remainder?'

"When this was said, the god Vasavatti said to the monk, 'I also don't know where the four great elements... cease without remainder. But there are the gods of the retinue of Brahma who are higher and more sublime than I. They should know where the four great elements... cease without remainder'...

"Then the monk attained to such a state of concentration that the way leading to the gods of the retinue of Brahma appeared in his centered mind. So he approached the gods of the retinue of Brahma and, on arrival, asked them, 'Friends, where do these four great elements — the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property — cease without remainder?'

"When this was said, the gods of the retinue of Brahma said to the monk, 'We also don't know where the four great elements... cease without remainder. But there is Brahma, the Great Brahma, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be. He is higher and more sublime than we. He should know where the four great elements... cease without remainder.'

"'But where, friends, is the Great Brahma now?'

"'Monk, we also don't know where Brahma is or in what way Brahma is. But when signs appear, light shines forth, and a radiance appears, Brahma will appear. For these are the portents of Brahma's appearance: light shines forth and a radiance appears.'

"Then it was not long before Brahma appeared.

"So the monk approached the Great Brahma and, on arrival, said, 'Friend, where do these four great elements — the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property — cease without remainder?'

"When this was said, the Great Brahma said to the monk, 'I, monk, am Brahma, the Great Brahma, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be.'

A second time, the monk said to the Great Brahma, 'Friend, I didn't ask you if you were Brahma, the Great Brahma, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be. I asked you where these four great elements — the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property — cease without remainder.'

"A second time, the Great Brahma said to the monk, 'I, monk, am Brahma, the Great Brahma, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be.'

"A third time, the monk said to the Great Brahma, 'Friend, I didn't ask you if you were Brahma, the Great Brahma, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be. I asked you where these four great elements — the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property — cease without remainder.'

"Then the Great Brahma, taking the monk by the arm and leading him off to one side, said to him, 'These gods of the retinue of Brahma believe, "There is nothing that the Great Brahma does not know. There is nothing that the Great Brahma does not see. There is nothing of which the Great Brahma is unaware. There is nothing that the Great Brahma has not realized." That is why I did not say in their presence that I, too, don't know where the four great elements... cease without remainder. So you have acted wrongly, acted incorrectly, in bypassing the Blessed One in search of an answer to this question elsewhere. Go right back to the Blessed One and, on arrival, ask him this question. However he answers it, you should take it to heart.'

"Then — just as a strong man might extend his flexed arm or flex his extended arm — the monk disappeared from the Brahma world and immediately appeared in front of me. Having bowed down to me, he sat to one side. As he was sitting there he said to me, 'Lord, where do these four great elements — the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property — cease without remainder?'

"When this was said, I said to him,^[2] 'Once, monk, some sea-faring merchants took a shore-sighting bird and set sail in their ship. When they could not see the shore, they released the shore-sighting bird. It flew to the east, south, west, north, straight up, and to all the intermediate points of the compass. If it saw the shore in any direction, it flew there. If it did not see the shore in any direction, it returned right back to the ship. In the same way, monk, having gone as far as the Brahma world in search of an answer to your question, you have come right back to my presence.'

"Your question should not be phrased in this way: Where do these four great elements — the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property — cease without remainder? Instead, it should be phrased like this:

Where do water, earth, fire, & wind
have no footing?
Where are long & short,
coarse & fine,
fair & foul,
name & form
brought to an end?

"And the answer to that is:

Consciousness without feature,^[1]
without end,
luminous all around:
Here water, earth, fire, & wind
have no footing.
Here long & short
coarse & fine
fair & foul
name & form
are all brought to an end.
With the cessation of [the activity of] consciousness
each is here brought to an end."

That is what the Blessed One said. Gratified, Kevatta the householder delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

1.

Viññanam anidassanam. This term is nowhere explained in the Canon, although MN 49 mentions that it "does not partake in the allness of the All" — the "All" meaning the six internal and six external sense media (see [SN 35.23](#)). In this it differs from the consciousness factor in dependent co-arising, which is defined in terms of the six sense media. Lying outside of time and space, it would also not come under the consciousness-aggregate, which covers all consciousness near and far; past, present, and future. However, the fact that it is outside of time and space — in a dimension where there is no here, there, or in between ([Ud 1.10](#)), no coming, no going, or staying ([Ud 8.1](#)) — means that it cannot be described as permanent or omnipresent, terms that have meaning only within space and time. The standard description of nibbana after death is, "All that is sensed, not being relished, will grow cold right here." (See [MN 140](#) and [Iti 44](#).) Again, as "all" is defined as the sense media, this raises the question as to whether consciousness without feature is not covered by this "all." However, [AN](#)

[4.174](#) warns that any speculation as to whether anything does or doesn't remain after the remainderless stopping of the six sense media is to "objectify non-objectification," which gets in the way of attaining the non-objectified. Thus this is a question that is best put aside.

2.

This passage also appears at [AN 6.54](#). — *Ed.*

Elsewhere, in a note to his translation of the “Brahma-nimantanika Sutta: The Brahma Invitation,” *Majjhima Nikaya*, 49, Ajahn Thanissaro comments further on this Pali term of *viññanam anidassanam* as follows:

Consciousness without surface (*viññanam anidassanam*): This term appears to be related to the following image from [SN 12.64](#):

"Just as if there were a roofed house or a roofed hall having windows on the north, the south, or the east. When the sun rises, and a ray has entered by way of the window, where does it land?"

"On the western wall, lord."

"And if there is no western wall, where does it land?"

"On the ground, lord."

"And if there is no ground, where does it land?"

"On the water, lord."

"And if there is no water, where does it land?"

"It does not land, lord."

"In the same way, where there is no passion for the nutriment of physical food ... contact ... intellectual intention ... consciousness, where there is no delight, no craving, then consciousness does not land there or grow. Where consciousness does not land or grow, name-&-form does not alight. Where name-&-form does not alight, there is no growth of fabrications. Where there is no growth of fabrications, there is no production of renewed becoming in the future. Where there is no production of renewed becoming in the future, there is no future birth, aging, & death. That, I tell you, has no sorrow, affliction, or despair."

In other words, normal sensory consciousness is experienced because it has a "surface" against which it lands: the sense organs and their objects, which constitute the "all." For instance, we experience visual consciousness because of the eye and forms of which we are conscious. Consciousness without surface, however, is directly known, without intermediary, free from any dependence on conditions at all.

This consciousness thus differs from the consciousness factor in dependent co-arising, which is defined in terms of the six sense media. Lying outside of time and space, it would also not come under the consciousness-aggregate, which covers all consciousness near and far; past, present, and future. And, as [SN 35.23](#) notes, the word "all" in the Buddha's teaching covers only the six sense media, which is another reason for not including this consciousness under the aggregates. However, the fact that it is outside of time and space — in a dimension where there is no here, there, or in between ([Ud I.10](#)), no coming, no going, or staying ([Ud VIII.1](#)) — means that it cannot be described as permanent or omnipresent, terms that have meaning only within space and time.

Some have objected to the equation of this consciousness with nibbana, on the grounds that nibbana is no where else in the Canon described as a form of consciousness. Thus they have proposed that consciousness without surface be regarded as an arahant's consciousness of nibbana in meditative experience, and not nibbana itself. This argument, however, contains two flaws: (1) The term *viññanam anidassanam* also occurs in [DN 11](#), where it is described as where name & form are brought to an end: surely a synonym for nibbana. (2) If nibbana is an object of mental consciousness (as a dhamma), it would come under the all, as an object of the intellect. There are passages in the Canon (such as [AN 9.36](#)) that describe meditators experiencing nibbana as a dhamma, but these passages seem to indicate that this description applies up through the level of non-returning. Other passages, however, describe nibbana as the ending of all dhammas. For instance, [Sn V.6](#) quotes the Buddha as calling the attainment of the goal the transcending of all dhammas. [Sn IV.6](#) and [Sn IV.10](#) state that the arahant has transcended dispassion, said to be the highest dhamma. Thus, for the arahant, nibbana is not an object of consciousness. Instead it is directly known without mediation. Because consciousness without feature is directly known without mediation, there seems good reason to equate the two.

Both of these descriptions of this term, as that which is left when *nama-rupa* comes to an end, and as “consciousness-without-surface,” fit well with my own experience of this part of the chain of dependent origination before the boundary of self is fully established. The link of structured (we could say “surfaced” or “boundaried”) consciousness involves the first establishment of a boundary or surface to the sense of any boundary to the body, a sense of boundary that is then intensified and solidified at the link of *nama-rupa*. This apparent boundary, of course, then provides the surfaces upon which the six sense doors interact with the apparently external environment at the next link of the six sense modalities.

The activity of consciousness is just this subtle energy activity which creates this boundary/surface in our experience of consciousness. And before this boundary-creating activity has solidified, that is before the emergence in the sequence of Dependent Origination of the link of *nama-rupa*, there is also no sense of materiality per se, including the four great experiential elements of earth, air, water, and fire.

Gary

Subtle Energy

The following is a selection of excerpts from my dissertation regarding the topic of subtle energy.

Gary

Perspectives on Subtle Energy, the Subtle Body and Subtle Sense Capacities

This section explores the topic of subtle energy, its correlate the subtle body and the subtle sensory capacities which give experiential access to this realm of phenomena. Literature from those who address these topics as first person experiences as well as the work of those who explore them from the third person scientific perspective are explored. Lastly we will examine the relationship between subtle energy and consciousness.

According to *Webster's New World Dictionary*, the word 'energy' has its roots in the Greek word *energeia* meaning "active, at work." ⁱ 'Work' is further defined as "the action or effect produced by natural forces." ⁱⁱ The Western science of physics currently acknowledges four kinds of natural forces, listed by Phaedra and Isaac Bonewits as "gravitation, electromagnetism, weak nuclear, and strong nuclear." ⁱⁱⁱ Energy is that which is expended in the application of a force during the activity of work and comes in various kinds such as "nuclear, chemical, electrical, magnetic, radiant, thermal, kinetic, (and) potential." ^{iv} As *Webster's New World Dictionary* further notes, according to Einstein's well known equation $E=mc^2$, energy and matter are convertible into each other. ^v Miriam Dyak thus observes that science seems to suggest that ultimately everything is energy. ^{vi}

Yet as Bonewits and Bonewits point out, a "magician, mystic, or energy worker" would each use the term somewhat differently. ^{vii} The physicist views energy from the

objective third person perspective while a mystic or an energy healer refers to a subjective experience. Those energies the effects of which are reported by some from a first person perspective are often considered to be too faint to be measured by third person scientific techniques. David Feinstein notes that the term ‘subtle energy’ is commonly understood to refer to just this kind of energy.^{viii} Yet, according to Brennan, these two categories of energy nonetheless exist on a single energy continuum.^{ix} William Tiller describes the range of subtle energy as “all those beyond the four well-known and accepted classes of forces” but would not agree that these energies are unmeasurable.^x Presenting an alternative meaning, T.M. Srinivasan suggests that subtle energy phenomena could turn out to be the expression of an underlying kind of energy field more basic than electromagnetic fields.^{xi} Gloria Alvino defines field as “a condition in space that has the potential of producing force” leading to Field Theory, which conceives of the universe, including our bodies, as being full of fields of various kinds, the forces of which are constantly interacting with each other.^{xii}

Andreas Wehowsky writes that there is extensive subjective evidence from the spiritual traditions which supports the existence of subtle energies.^{xiii} Eligio Gallegos points out that while the West has generally looked at the body from a materialistic perspective involving cells, tissues, organs and biological functionality, and the mind from the perspective of behavior, emotions, cognitive functions, awareness or imagination, in the East the human being is seen first and foremost, both physically and psychologically, as an energy system.^{xiv} However a growing body of literature shows the significant degree to which the Eastern view is entering the Western psyche.

Two non-Buddhist traditions are prominently represented in this literature: the North Asian tradition of qi and the kundalini tradition of South Asia. Garret Yount, Qian Yifang and Honglin Zhang define qi as *universal healing energy*.^{xv} Lee, Myeong Soo, Young Hoon Rim, and Chang-won Kang call qi *vital energy*, while Sun Ok Chang uses the collection of English words “energy, force, vitality and strength” to describe qi.^{xvi} According to Douglas Matzke, qi is a non-physical field surrounding all living things.^{xvii} Ted Kaptchuk writes that no one English word adequately serves as a translation of qi. He proposes conceiving of qi as “matter on the verge of becoming energy or energy at the point of materializing.”^{xviii} Tart acknowledges the difficulty in defining qi suggesting that the whole universe is a flowing of something indefinable that can only be apprehended subjectively, the experience of which is something akin to a mental, or even archetypal, image, a kind of imagining which nonetheless has objective effects.^{xix}

For Christopher Hills, kundalini is not something objective (separate from the experiencer) nor is it an energy, nor can it be explained physiologically. Rather kundalini is prephysical, ultimately not different from consciousness itself.^{xx} Haridas Chaudhari equates kundalini with the primordial energy out of which everything in the Universe is fabricated, an energy that is the same energy as that of science but rather seen not through our ordinary physical senses but by what he calls *transpersonal superconscient sense modalities*.^{xxi} Lee Sanella sees kundalini as an energy that lies dormant at the base of the spine, and which, when awakened, rises autonomously through the center of the body, spreading throughout the body as felt bodily sensations.^{xxii}

The literature on subtle energy describes in detail a corresponding subtle body, which Eden refers to as the body’s *subtle infrastructure*.^{xxiii} Bruce Burger calls this “the

wireless anatomy of the energy fields of the body.”^{xxiv} According to William Collinge, this energetic anatomy is not limited to our physical body but consists of several interrelated fields extending from within the body out into the external environment.^{xxv} Caroline Myss depicts the energy field she works with as stretching beyond the physical body as far as the arms can reach. She characterizes this field as “a highly sensitive perceptual system ... a kind of conscious electricity that transmits and receives messages from other people’s bodies” and the source of information for what we call intuition.^{xxvi} Bruyere calls this energy field the ‘aura’ and depicts it as related to “the electromagnetic field which emanates from all matter.”^{xxvii} Dyak adds the notion of *energy centers*, or chakras, to that of energy fields, together which form what she calls our *energy body*.^{xxviii} Myss depicts the chakra system as associated with kundalini energy.^{xxix} Bruyere credits the activity of the chakras, or small vortices of energy spinning within the body, with generating the human aura.^{xxx} Louchakova and Warner define the subtle body as “the temporal structures of the psyche recognized within the space of introspection ‘inside’ the physical body.”^{xxxi} Wilber feels that the energetic quality of the subtle body is best described as states of blissful awareness in which our ordinary sense of bodily boundary no longer applies.^{xxxii}

In Western Psychology the term *libido*, originally used by Sigmund Freud, is a parallel concept to that of subtle energy. Reber defines libido as a form of mental or psychic energy still most often associated today with sexual desire, in spite of the fact that Freud’s later works give it more the flavor of “life energy.”^{xxxiii} Calvin Hill credits Freud with discovering that the energy dynamics described in physics and acknowledged in biological sciences, have a correlate in the mind. This energetic understanding of the

mind and the study of “the transformations and exchanges of energy within the personality” became the foundation of Freud’s dynamic psychology.^{xxxiv}

A different Western view of subtle energy is offered by Wilhelm Reich. Reich defines a form of subtle energy he calls the *orgone energy* in the following manner: “Primordial cosmic energy; universally present and demonstrable visually, thermally, electroscopically, and by means of Geiger-Mueller counters. In the living organism, bioenergy, life energy.”^{xxxv} Reich concludes that that orgone energy has characteristics that are fundamentally different from electricity and magnetism.^{xxxvi}

But how is knowledge about subtle energy and the subtle body gained? Like Myss, Jean Metzker and Dorothy Leigh, describe the human subtle energy system as a source of information and learning beyond the five senses.^{xxxvii} Louchakova and Warner introduce the term *psychosomatic mysticism*, a spirituality grounded in “direct apperception (perception with understanding) of the structures of consciousness in the body by bypassing the input of the senses,” experience which they note naturally appears as a consequence of deep meditative concentration.^{xxxviii} Some writers depict their personal experiences of subtle sensory capacities in relation to subtle energy and the subtle body. For example, Brennan writes that for her, the human aura feels like “currents of wind or energy.”^{xxxix} Bruyere portrays her experience of transmitting healing energy to a client as like a liquid flowing through her body.^{xl} Marie Carlsson describes her experience of subtle energies as similar to, though subtler than, the experience of proprioception, but describes the two as interacting with each other.^{xli} Eden reports that the direct perception of such energies can occur at subtle versions of any of the five senses.^{xlii}

Bruyere suggests that not only subtle sensory experience but all our experiences (sensory impressions, thoughts, etc.) are actually expressions of subtle energy.^{xliii} She writes

When a stimulus comes into the body is it registered in the first chakra. The response in the electromagnetic field of the first chakra, producing an energy flow out of the first center, into the second, out the third, and into the heart chakra. In many of us the heart chakra is typically the place where this flow of energy is absorbed or drained from the field. . . . However if energy is not drained or absorbed by the heart chakra, it is free to continue out the fifth chakra, the sixth, and finally out the seventh or crown chakra.^{xliiv}

Bruyere believes that such stimuli leading to energetic flow within the body comes from the earth's own magnetic field, though she acknowledges that others attribute it to a more universal magnetic field which enters the body from above.^{xliv}

Western style scientific exploration of subtle energies comes in several varieties including research on the nature of traditional energies, like qi, research on the physical and psychological effects of subtle energies, and research on hypothetical forms of energy including and outside the four forces of the standard scientific model. Yan Xin, reviewing the literature on empirical qi research, primarily in China, reports that findings support the following general statements: "qi can be observed, measured, and quantified by precise instruments, qi has the properties of matter, qi has the properties of energy, and qi conveys . . . information content or has the characteristics of information."^{xlvi}

Hunt, studying the work of various kinds of healers (e.g., hands-on energy healers, acupuncturists, and Rolfers), discovered a somatic field of energy beyond the electrical activity recorded by standard medical measurements.^{xlvii} She correlated instrumental measurements of this field with the observations of eight experienced aura readers (people who have the special sensory ability to see the human aura), whose

results were further compared with each other. The activity of this field was faster than neurological activity and correlated well with the reports of the aura readers.^{xlviii}

Recording changes in this field simultaneously with changes in blood pressure, heart beat, etc., as well as in response to varied intensity of stimuli, she found that changes in the aura always occurred before changes in any other variable, even when the stimulus was too small to either be consciously noted by the recipient or to activate the nervous system at an unconscious level.^{xlix} Hunt also studied the effects of environmental electromagnetic fields on human subjects.¹ She used a *Mu Room*, where the electromagnetic field can be altered without affecting other factors, discovering that varying the electrical or magnetic aspects of the field evoked changes in her subjects' bodily coordination, ability to locate themselves in space, and awareness of their body boundary.^{li}

James Oschman points to a significant aspect of electromagnetic fields, noting that they are associated with direct current electricity, such as brain waves or the electrical activity generated by the heart. They are thus propagated throughout the circulatory system as full-body electrical activity.^{lii} Hunt adds that the direct current, continuous nature of human energy fields is what allows them to be vehicles of energy-based communication with external energy sources.^{liii} Tiller observes that all human cells have the capacity to both emit and absorb electromagnetic radiation of at least one energy level. Based on this fact, he proposes that the human body has antenna-like capacities, serving to both broadcast and receive a wide spectrum of electromagnetic radiation.^{liv} He uses theories of the physics of energy fields around antennas to demonstrate that antennas can produce mandala-like energy signatures very

similar to the petaled flower mandala-like imagery found in the spiritual traditions to visually depict the chakras. He even notes that under certain conditions, these mandala-like antenna energy signatures are found to be rotating.^{lv}

This antenna theory regarding electromagnetic energy and fields dovetails nicely with another line of Tiller's work. In the early 1970s, Tiller developed a biological radiation detector specifically to study subtle energy.^{lvi} He discovered an energy both emitted and received by human subjects that was not classical electromagnetic energy.^{lvii} He found that his subjects could be divided into transmitters or projectors (e.g., healers, *qigong* practitioners) and receivers (e.g., clairvoyants) of this subtle energy.^{lviii}

Several authors present interesting developmental perspectives drawing on subtle energy, the subtle energy body, and subtle sensory capacities. Wilber offers a description of how during early development the transcendent bliss with which the infant is born gets constricted into a hierarchical series of apparent knots or chakras, each progressively lower knot being more restrictive and exclusive than its predecessor.^{lix} The entire process finally culminates in what he suggests is an *egoic-genital tyranny*, resulting in a "personal identity confined to the boundaries of his skin."^{lx} Liedloff suggests that when an infant is in continual physical contact with their mother, their energy fields merge and the infant's excess energy is discharged through her body. This discharge helps to keep the infant aware of its connectedness to the world around it.^{lxi} Jean Metzker and Geoffrey Leigh used skilled aura readers to observe children in an American daycare center at approximately six-month, 30-month and 54-month intervals. They reported their observations of changes in infants' auras using a coding form covering six parameters

such as density, width, and brightness. Their results support the hypothesis that human energy fields grow smaller and denser as children develop from six to 54 months.^{lxii}

Yet what is the relationship between subtle energy and consciousness? The literature reveals a wide variety of views on this topic. Ronald Mann equates consciousness and subtle energy, noting that the term *energetic consciousness* is used in touch healing modalities.^{lxiii} Alvino finds that the plethora of theories points towards a unification of mind, energy, and consciousness. She observes that meditation is a way to open into the experience of “our oneness with the universal energy, the unified field, or consciousness.”^{lxiv} Louchakova and Warner write that kundalini energy “is the power of pure consciousness to unfold the world of multiplicity (i.e., present phenomena). It is the impulse of the unmanifest consciousness to become manifest.”^{lxv}

Mark Woodhouse writes that while consciousness and energy are often talked about in the same contexts, no good paradigm linking them has been proposed.^{lxvi} He presents his own, which he calls *energy monism*, suggesting that consciousness is the inside of energy while energy is the exterior of consciousness.^{lxvii} For Larry Dossey, Woodhouse’s energy monism begs new questions, such as the nature of the boundary between the interior and exterior of energy.^{lxviii} Observing that consciousness can only be known from a first person perspective, Wilber argues that consciousness and subtle energy are not the same but are intimately related.^{lxix} Christian de Quincey presents his own theory of the relationship as follows: “consciousness is the ability of matter/energy to feel, to know and to direct itself.”^{lxx} He thus introduces the element of intentionality.

Louchakova and Warner’s paradigm of psychosomatic mysticism offers yet another alternative. They write “Subtle energies provide the link between (the chakras

and channels of the subtle body) and the psyche and its contents (meaning) and the gradient between the subjectivity of pure Self Awareness and the objectified world.”^{lxxi} Louchakova and Warner thus conclude that subject and object are related via the spectrum of subtle energies, a relationship which can be studied directly through subtle, detailed perceptions of the body.^{lxxii} Their views are close to my own but do not specify the patterned subtle, dynamic, energetic details of this relationship that I hypothesize.^{lxxiii}

In summary, there is substantial evidence from both the first and third person perspectives documenting subtle energy phenomena and the subtle body anatomy to which such phenomena are intimately related, including some confirmation that is empirical in nature. A few writers go so far as to link subtle energy to consciousness in various ways. However none offer empirical evidence in support of their assertion of this link nor does any author specifically describe either a boundary-forming role for subtle energy in the construction of the subject-object form of consciousness.^{lxxiv} Only Hunt, with her Mu Room experiments, suggests a functional relationship between subtle energy and self boundary. But even here it is the presence or absence of a kind of subtle energy in the field, as opposed to subtle energy activity, that shifts the subjective experience of boundary. Also lacking is any study of a role for subtle energy phenomena in the adult transition from subject-object consciousness to participatory consciousness, the focus of this research project, though Hunt’s research hints that this may be the case.

The study of consciousness has been a strong focus within the field of psychology for many years. While perhaps a bit more peripheral, a role for subtle energy in psychological processes has been acknowledged at least since Freud first wrote about libido in the early twentieth century. Some initial research has been done in this direction,

for example by Hunt, Metzker and Leigh, and Tiller. With the emergence of the still nascent field of Energy Psychology, it is important now to empirically explore the relationship between subtle energy and various forms of consciousness. The suggestion of the central role of the boundary-forming patterned activity of subtle energy in the structuring of the subject-object forms of consciousness serves, in the context of this research, as a theory to be empirically tested to this end. This study also builds on Mu Room research by Hunt showing a relationship between subtle energy and boundary experience but uses an approach grounded in the subjective boundary experiences of expert Buddhist meditators without relying on technologically created changes in the environmental energy fields.

Buddhist Perspectives on Consciousness and Subtle Energy

Excerpts

Hayward presents a Vajrayana view, parallel to the Theravadan perspective above. It constitutes a description, grounded in the experience of master meditation practitioners, of how out of the unitary background of experience the split into self and world arises.^{lxxv} First there is the “activation of the five senses ... a preconscious recognition of patterning” that involves the separation into inner and outer and, in the external patterning, the distinction between one aspect and another.^{lxxvi} Then a feeling tone emerges in response to the external patterning. Next comes the cognitive aspect, both in relation to a particular object within the external patterning, as well as the first cognitive hint of a sense-of-self, associated with the inner aspect of the patterning. Then there follows a process of projection of meaning from the inner onto the outer including a

linguistic label together with connotations. Last to emerge is our ordinary consciousness including a subtle, implied sense-of-self.^{lxxvii} This process represents the sequential emergence of the five *skhandhas* resulting in our being “stuck in a mode of perception in which space is an empty container filled with apparently separate objects.”^{lxxviii}

Tenzin Wangyal, representing the Tibetan Bön tradition, describes the first stirrings of subject-object consciousness in subtle energy terms as follows:

For each of us, everything begins with the primordial space, the Great Mother from which all things arise, in which all things exist, and into which all things dissolve. In this space there is movement. What causes it, no one knows. The teachings only say ‘the winds of karma moved.’ This is the movement of *lung* or *prana*, the energy that pervades infinite space without characteristics or divisions. Inseparably united with the flow of *prana* is the flow of primordial awareness, pure and without identity. In this pure awareness the five lights arise.^{lxxix}

These five lights are the expression of the luminous nature of primordial awareness and represent the five elements in the form of light that is too subtle to be seen and energy that is too subtle to measure. Yet according to Wangyal, it is these energies which give rise to all other energies including the grosser lights and energies of our everyday world. When not perceived with clarity these energies evolve in the direction of greater and greater substantiality, the source of all dualistic aspects of experience including the knowing subject and its objects.^{lxxx} Wangyal is careful to point out that this story is *not* a creation story, like the physicists’ *Big Bang Theory* that tells how the universe began. Rather it is a description of our ongoing lived experience. If the nature of the five lights is not clearly seen, *samsāra*, the conditioned world of suffering, ensues. When clarity prevails, *nirvana*, the cessation of suffering, characterizes our experience.^{lxxxii} Barth provides a similar description from the Vajrayana Buddhist tradition.^{lxxxii}

Wallace offers an analogous vision when he quotes Dudjom Lingpa: “This ground is ... like water in its natural fluid state freezing into a cold wind. It is due to dualistic grasping onto subjects and objects that the ground, which is naturally free, becomes frozen into the appearances of things.”^{lxxxiii} Wallace describes two layers to this primordial background that congeals into subject-object consciousness, the *bhavanga* out of which an individual expression of subject-object consciousness arises, and the *dharmadhatu* out of which all phenomena arise.^{lxxxiv}

According to the Dalai Lama, within the Tibetan Buddhist tradition there are two distinct views about this process. In the first view, the experience of the division into a subject in relation to a multiplicity of objects represents an actual split into an objective aspect and a subjective aspect of experience. The opposing, and from the Dalai Lama’s perspective, preferable understanding, is that regardless of how the experience is felt, “the actual perceptual experience is a single unitary event.”^{lxxxv} These two areas of Tibetan thought, that of the *bhavanga* and *dharmadhatu* on the one hand, and the question of whether a split into subject and object actually takes place or not, on the other, offer an interesting bridge to Buddhist views on participatory consciousness.

Several mentions of energy above provide a bridge to the Buddhist perspective on subtle energy. Wallace notes that in contrast to Western science, in Buddhism, it is through direct personal experience that energy is investigated.^{lxxxvi} Wangyal describes subtle energy as unmeasurable but accessible to direct experience through yogic meditative disciplines. He enumerates three levels to this exploration as follows: an outer level that involves shamanic practices, an inner level that is associated with tantric

practices that work with posture, visualization, breath, and *mantra* (words or syllables, usually in *Sanskrit*, repeated either verbally or internally), and a secret level, involving recognition of energies as aspects of insubstantial luminosity inextricably associated with emptiness.^{lxxxvii} Preece adds that subtle energy is the creative aspect of luminosity, manifesting as our dreams, visions and fantasies.^{lxxxviii} Vajradevi writes about Vajrapani, one of the three principle iconic *Mahayana* Bodhisattvas, the one having perfected the energy of a Buddha.^{lxxxix} Vajrapani is depicted as holding a thunderbolt symbolizing the energetic quality of compassionate action for which Vajradevi uses the Sanskrit term *viriya*.^{xc} Vajradevi defines *viriya* as energy directed towards liberation that sees things as they really are instead of through ego's lens.^{xc1} This energy helps us to push through our dysfunctional habits. Vajradevi compares us as humans to icebergs with just a small fraction of our energy above the conscious limen. He says that through tantric practices we work to bring the unconscious energy into consciousness.^{xcii} According to Vessantara, "Tantra sees the whole world in terms of energy."^{xciii}

Several writers note the role of energy in creating human suffering. Ajahn Rat Rattanayano writes that when our energy is associated with ignorance, *cetasika* (mental formations) arise, enclosing and tugging on the mind, a process that when not seen clearly leads to discontent.^{xciv} While, as detailed above, Wangyal describes the Buddhist view that we come into this life with our subtle energies already out of balance, Ajahn Sucitto suggests that the cultivation of *samādhi* and bodily awareness is critical to the process of balancing these energies.^{xcv} Ajahn Taniya writes about one particular form of human energy, that associated with sexual desire. She describes her practice of working with sexual energy by just opening to it with a curiosity about what it wants.^{xcvi} She

reports finding that the usual answer is “oneness or unity.” According to her, when sexual energy is simply allowed to move as energy without the influence of desire it transforms into devotional energy associated with the heart.^{xcvii}

Other Buddhist authors comment on the relationship of energy to mind and body. Drawing on her experiences with body-focused mindfulness practices, Mirka Knaster contrasts the sense of touch with that of proprioception, the latter referring to the experience of sensations originating within the body while the former involves sensations generated by contact between the body and objects outside it.^{xcviii} She then goes on to depict her experience of a third sense capacity which she calls the “*sense of energy*.”^{xcix} This she describes as our ability to sense the invisible and impalpable electromagnetic fields which surround everything, including people.^c According to Preece, subtle energy is known through subtle sensations that incessantly permeate the body and is the means through which we experience what he calls the energy-wind body, a two-way communication modality between consciousness and the physical body.^{ci} Wallace credits samatha meditation techniques with giving the practitioner access to the experiential realm of subtle energies.^{cii} This happens because by thus training the mind the perceptual acuity is greatly strengthened “lowering the threshold between conscious and unconscious mind.”^{ciii} Further development of concentration results in these energies coming into harmony, thus catalyzing the shift to the deep states of meditative absorption known as the *jhānas* and the *ārūppas*.^{civ}

What is the Buddhist perspective on the relationship between energy and consciousness? Ajahn Rat Rattanayano describes *citta*, often used as a synonym for *viññāna*, as “a form of energy.”^{cv} The Dalai Lama sees sentience, or subject-object

consciousness experienced through the senses, as connected with both energy and knowing.^{cv} Wangyal lists two main ways that subtle energies or lights can be experienced: dualistically, as the known objects of a knowing subject resulting in the ignorance and suffering of samsāra, or nondualistically, in which their appearance is self-know from within, an expression of wisdom.^{cvii} According to Fenner, beings who have mastered this nondualistic mode “create an energy field that has a potency and immediacy.”^{cviii} For Wallace, primordial consciousness is replete with unlimited energy. He says this energy is the source of every other kind of energy, such as thermal, kinetic, electromagnetic, and gravitational energies described by physicists.^{cx} Vajradevi, writing about Buddhist tantra, the study of “the movement of energy and direct experience,” notes that when we move beyond our tendency to conceptualize to what he calls the non-rational, “we can experience ourselves as pure energy or pure awareness that is unmediated by concepts.”^{cx} Hayward alludes to such a direct experiential approach when he suggests that through the practice of mindfulness of the body we can become aware of the energy activity around us in which we are immersed leading to a realization of our deeply intimate relationship with nature.^{cx}

Imaginal Approaches to Consciousness and Subtle Energy

Excerpts

Joseph Campbell explores this theme from the perspective of the world’s mythological traditions. A thesis he finds common to all great mythologies, which he terms the ‘universal doctrine,’ holds that

all the visible structures of the world – all things and beings – are the effects of a ubiquitous power out of which they arise, which supports and fills them during the period of their manifestation, and back into which they must ultimately dissolve.^{cxii}

Campbell equates this power with energy of Western science, *mana*, *shakti*, the Sioux Indian notion of *wakonda*, and, for Christians, “the power of God.”^{cxiii} He notes that the psychoanalytical traditions call it libido in its manifestation in the mind.^{cxiv} He credits the limitations of our senses and the patterns of our thinking with blocking this power and its activity from our view while myth and meditation, in the context of ritual, provide a way for us to open to this ordinarily inaccessible domain of experience.^{cxv} Myth and meditation are but doorways to what Campbell calls “that void, or being, beyond categories.”^{cxvi} He describes various mythological depictions of the emergence of the phenomenal world out of the void.^{cxvii}

Sewall depicts the participatory mode of perception as involving an expansion of consciousness into the spatial gap between subject and object, especially in our experience of vision, the sensory focus of the methodology.^{cxviii} She describes her own deep experience of vision as a “seamlessness between interior and exterior landscapes, between material and the symbolic realms.”^{cxix} She calls this way of experiencing the ‘ecological self,’ defined as a mode of being in which there is “a permeability and fluidity of boundaries” such that the split into inner and outer is known to be arbitrary rather than actual.^{cxx} This shift in experience of sight is characterized by the visual not only being seen but also felt viscerally as the “sensory world ... becomes embodied in us (and) subjective experience becomes sensuality” resulting in a change in our hearts - we fall in love with the world.^{cxxi}

Mindell offers a similar parallel to participatory consciousness with his idea of lucidity, characterized by a decreased involvement in “self and other dualities.”^{cxxii} Lucidity entails attending to a layer of experience “that precedes everything you think, see, hear, and do.”^{cxxiii} Lucidity leads to conscious participation in Dreaming, the realm of subtle primordial events that occur just before experience becomes structured into our ordinary subject-object mode of knowing.^{cxxiv} In a similar vein, Sussman describes the intensification of perception experienced by the Grail seeker involving a reallocation of attention to “the activity beneath our perception of fixed forms,” revealing the “‘becoming’ of things.”^{cxxv} This intensified perception requires what Sussman calls *becoming empty*, a stripping away of everything that gives us our sense of identity, even the identification with attentiveness itself, and reveals an underlying interconnectedness.^{cxxvi} We come to realize that it is this empty awareness itself that “take(s) the shape of all forms – sense impressions and objects of the physical world, thoughts and memories, feelings, impulses of will,” in short both subject and object.^{cxxvii}

Reason and Barfield both believe the participatory perspective is emerging in Western culture in the present historical period. Barfield would also warn that since our predominant Western view, that of Western Newtonian science, is fundamentally a denial of participation, the participatory perspective still remains taboo.^{cxxviii}

Clearly there is support in Imaginal Psychology for the view that the dissolution of the subject-object divide offers a doorway to participatory consciousness. But what does Imaginal Psychology say about the role of subtle energy and its structural correlate, the subtle body? Albert Kreinheder writes: “What the alchemists called the subtle body is

indistinguishable from our idea of the symbol. It is subtle . . . yet it is also a body and therefore has real substance.”^{cxxxix} Hillman seems to agree when he attributes to the subtle body both metaphorical and literal aspects.^{cxxx} Noting that sensing is central to our imaging process, Hillman says that imagination is “a great beast, as subtle body, within us.”^{cxxxix} He calls this subtle body “our brute awareness . . . the grand conjunction of body, soul, and spirit, . . . (of) concrete sensation, psychic image and spiritual meaning.”^{cxxxii}

Mansfield and Spiegelman distinguish between subtle body and symbol, positing the subtle body as one of two ways that the archetypal third, Jung’s transcendent function, can be experienced, the other being symbol.^{cxxxiii} Schwartz-Salant depicts the subtle body as containing both what we think of as inner and outer, sometimes as two distinct aspects, sometimes as a unity, and as lying between mind and matter.^{cxxxiv} Jung used his term *somatic unconscious* (in contrast to the psychic unconscious) as a synonym for the subtle body. He describes alchemists’ writings about transforming the body from material form into spirit, by which he suggests they mean the subtle body.^{cxxxv} Jung also depicts the opposite of this process: the development of the human body as analogous to the formation of a crystal guided by a preset abstract geometrical template, suggesting that the subtle body serves as this template for the physical body.^{cxxxvi} Mansfield and Spiegelman describe the subtle body as “the psyche functioning through its material substrate of organized energy patterns” while Schwartz-Salant says that it is possible to become aware that our bodies are energy fields, for him the alchemical equivalent of the subtle body experience.^{cxxxvii}

These references to energy raise questions concerning the nature of this energy and its relationship to both subject-object and participatory forms of consciousness. Von

Franz describes energy as occurring along a spectrum, with physical energy at one end and psychic energy at the other.^{cxxxviii} Jung, himself, further divides the expression of the psychic energy/libido end of this energy spectrum into a second polarity including one pole where the expression is energetic or instinctual while the opposite expression is imagery.^{cxxxix} Washburn sees three expressions of energy: 1) psychic energy, which he defines as egoic activity, 2) libido, and 3) a transformative energy he calls *spirit*.^{cxl} He argues that all three ensue from a more fundamental pool of energy.^{cxli} Karen Jaenke eloquently supports her contention that the material world is included in the realm of spiritual energy with a description of her own sense-of-self dissolving, resulting in an awareness of the ubiquity of spiritual energy.^{cxlii} Walter Odajnyk distinguishes between attention, which he equates with the psychic energy that the knowing self directs towards an object, and consciousness, for him, the psychic field in which known objects appear.^{cxliii} In his discussion of meditation and alchemy, Odajnyk describes the alchemical nature of meditation techniques which lead to a transformative union of psychic energy with consciousness.^{cxliv}

Some Imaginal Psychology authors also refer to terms for energy noted in the section on subtle energy. For example, for Anodea Judith, energy, which she describes as “excitement, charge, attention, awareness, ... the life force,” is the same as qi or *prana*.^{cxlv} Jung concludes that mana, the Polynesian term for energy, which was understood not conceptually but experientially, is likely the forerunner of libido/psychic energy.^{cxlvi}

Numerous Imaginal Psychology authors, including Jung, H. G. Coward, Judith, Mindell, Washburn, and Woodman and Dickson, write about another parallel concept for subtle energy, kundalini. For example, Jung relates kundalini to the subtle body through

its correlate, the chakra system, and to the process of individuation.^{cxlvii} Coward describes the role of kundalini in dissolving the “blockages to the free flow of energy through the subtle body.”^{cxlviii} Marion Woodman and Elinor Dickson note the transformative potential of kundalini, specifically pointing to its ability to overcome dualistic modes of experience.^{cxlix} Washburn sees kundalini as a parallel concept to his idea that the Dynamic Ground can become activated, releasing spirit, directly experienced by the ego *as energy*, into one’s being.^{cl}

Other writers find links between subtle energy and archetypes. Aizenstadt offers the following general definition of the term ‘archetype’ as “psychological patterns that appear throughout human experience and can be seen in the motifs of age-old myths, legends, fairytales found in every culture throughout the history of the human species.”^{cli} Esther Harding describes archetypes as “patterns of psychic energy, of life energy.”^{clii} Solomon says that archetypes are “unconscious universal structures, inherited blueprints, or templates, which organize psychic energy along certain repeatable and recognizable lines.”^{cliii} Jung, himself, described archetypes as embedded in a field of energy.^{cliv} Naomi Goldenberg depicts archetypes, which she says lie behind symbol and image, as having two polarized facets, similar to Jung’s polarity of psychic energy. At one pole resides an archetype’s dynamism, here a parallel for energy, while its image lies at the other.^{clv} Writing from the Eastern alchemical perspective, Michael Winn depicts configurations of flowing qi as a kind of language, the energetic patterning of which serves as its grammar, a description reminiscent of Harding’s use of the term archetype.^{clvi} Odajnyk suggests that when archetypes express themselves in material or psychic forms they do so as “energetic structures” amenable to analysis because their recurring activity

follows laws of nature.^{clvii} He goes on to describe the possibility of the energy being withdrawn from “the phenomenal structure of symbolic form” with the subsequent withering of the form.^{clviii}

Aizenstadt provides an interesting twist to this topic when he offers the view that archetypes exist both psychically and in the physical world around us.^{clix} This line of thought suggests to him a broadening of Jung’s psychology. He notes that neither Jung nor Freud emphasized the interconnectedness between persons and their physical environment.^{clx} He suggests a new term, ‘world unconscious,’ which he depicts as deeper and broader than either of Jung’s notions of personal or collective unconscious. The *world unconscious* is his term for the interrelated and interconnected nature of all things of the natural world.^{clxi} Dennis offers the view that ultimately the goal of spiritual transformation is the “synthesis of consciousness with the whole world,” her phrase for Jung’s term *unus mundus*, thus suggesting that maybe Jung did, in fact, place importance on this deeper union.^{clxii}

Jeanette Armstrong explores parallels to this line of thought found in indigenous culture. Writing about the world view of the North American Indian tribe, the Okanagan, she describes the Okanagan’s four notions of self: the physical self or body, the emotional self, the thinking self and the spiritual self. The Okanagans, she writes, equate the word ‘body’ with the Earth itself.^{clxiii} Their notion of the spiritual self is both individual and includes all things.

We translate the word used for our spirit self as ‘without substance while moving continuously outward.’ ... this self requires a great quietness before our other parts can become conscious of it and that the other capacities fuse together and subside in order to activate something else – which is this capacity. The Okanagans describe this capacity as the place where all things are.^{clxiv}

According to Armstrong, the Okanagan call the spirit self the true self. In their view it is “a source for all things...the living source of our life” and has great power, “affect(ing) all things if we engage it within the rest of our life-force activity.”^{clxv}

Anita Barrows takes this ecological line of thinking into the realm of developmental psychology. She decries our western cultural emphasis on independence and mastery at the expense of the child’s ability to connect, join and merge. Like Aizenstadt, she champions the need for a developmental psychology “not exclusively founded in the world of social relationships.”^{clxvi} For Barrows, a child’s developing boundaries need to provide structure and containment while also remaining permeable, allowing for “interconnected(ness) not only with other humans but with all living beings and processes ...”^{clxvii} This permeability allows for the possibility of experiences without clear subject-object division, the realm of participatory consciousness.^{clxviii} Such a developmental psychology, she says, would take into account not only what the child is moving away from but what they are moving towards, acknowledging that separation from the mother allows for a wider circle of connectedness with both human and non-human objects of experience.^{clxix} This broadening sphere of interconnections, she feels, is as critical to our well being as is human attachment. She writes that our experience of bodily separateness, to her an illusion, is the “genuine sorrow” of human existence.^{clxx}

Hillman goes so far as to declare that “there is only one core issue in all of psychology. *Where is the “me”?* Where does the “me” begin? Where does the “me” stop? Where does the “other” begin.”^{clxxi} He later adds the question “where does psyche stop and matter begin?” Offering an answer to his own queries, Hillman asserts that

the cut between the self and natural world is arbitrary, we can make it at the skin or we can take it as far out as you like – to the deep oceans and distant stars. But the cut is far less important than the uncertainty about making the cut at all. This uncertainty opens the mind to wonder again, allowing fresh considerations to enter the therapeutic equation.^{clxxii}

Focusing on the issue of human perceptual capacities, Sewall takes this discussion into the realm of the philosophy of science. She decries Western scientific preoccupation with norms to the exclusion of potentials, a particularly telling limitation, she says, when it comes to the study of our sensory experience.^{clxxiii} What then is our potential sensory capacity and how does it relate to subtle energy and the subtle body? Dennis describes a subtle experiential realm that partakes of both body and mind, a realm that can be perceived as imagery or sensed kinesthetically (from sensations originating in the muscles, tendons or joints) which she calls the subtle sensory precursors to the image.^{clxxiv} She thus takes a proprioceptive view of subtle energy and offers her perspective that the resolution of opposites such as subject and object is always deeply energetic in nature.^{clxxv}

Hillman notes that we have two layers of sensing involved in our experience of images, a gross sensing which results in the noun, verb, adjective and adverb aspects of our linguistic descriptions of images and a more subtle sensing that informs us of the relational nature of the things and activities of the image, linguistically expressed by prepositions.^{clxxvi} This second sensing, according to Hillman, is also a “sensing of archetypal invisibles, ...a permeating ether that dissolves the very possibility of separate faculties, functions, and realms,” and involves the subtle body and the chakra system.^{clxxvii} Mindell describes two distinct modes of experience associated with Dreaming, one verbalizable, such as dreams, the other non-verbal, including subtle sensations.^{clxxviii} John Conger, whose work integrates that of Jung and Reich, allows for both a free association

of the mind, working with images such as dreams, and what he calls a “free association of the body” whereby his clients track the natural movement of energy in the body.^{clxxxix}

Mansfield and Spiegelman suggest that the subtle body, which is “the psyche operating through its substrate of organized energy patterns,” is the organ of perception that senses the interactive field.^{clxxx} Schwartz-Salant describes experiencing patterns of energy in the field between himself and his client that form a perceptible link between the two.^{clxxxii}

Such intensified perceptual acuity can be cultivated. Dennis offers prayer, contemplation, ritual and art along with meditation as modalities that can develop our subtle senses.^{clxxxiii} Mindell advocates the use of deep concentration and mindfulness in combination resulting in the subtle sensory capacity he calls lucidity.^{clxxxiv} Sewall concurs, emphasizing mindfulness of seeing especially focused on the exploration of the contextual dimension of relationships and the apparent interfaces between things.^{clxxxv} Schwartz-Salant describes a subtle shift in the focus of attention from the object itself to the space around it that brings the interactive field into focus, an alteration he depicts as alchemical in nature.^{clxxxvi} According to Mansfield and Spiegelman, the emergence of the capacity to consciously experience the energies of the subtle body is the result of spiritual and somatic practices and not an expression of normal bodily activity, a view similar to my own experience.^{clxxxvii} Odajnyk draws parallels between the deep states of concentration in Buddhist practice of the āruppas, particularly the third and fourth āruppas, and Jung’s notion of the personal and collective versions of the unconsciousness. He refers to a further deepening of concentration, described in the Buddhist tradition as the ‘cessation of feeling and perception,’ as equivalent to the formless Self.^{clxxxviii}

-
- ⁱ. Webster's *New World Dictionary*, entry for "energy."
- ⁱⁱ. Ibid., entry for "work."
- ⁱⁱⁱ. Phaedra Bonewits, and Issac Bonewits. *Real Energy: Systems, Spirits and Substances to Heal, Change and Grow* (Franklin Lakes, NJ: New Page Books, 2007): 22-23.
- ^{iv}. Ibid.
- ^v. Webster's *New World Dictionary*, entry on 'matter.'
- ^{vi}. Miriam Dyak, *The Voice Dialogue Facilitators Handbook: Part 1* (Seattle, WA: L.I.F.E. Energy Press, 1999): 73.
- ^{vii}. Bonewits and Bonewits. *Real Energy*, 21.
- ^{viii}. David Feinstein, "Subtle Energy: Psychology's Missing Link," *Shift in Action: IONS Noetic Sciences Review* 64, (June 2003): 3.
- ^{ix}. Brennan, "Possible Physics of the Human Energy Field," 4.
- ^x. Tiller. *Science and Human Transformation*, 14.
- ^{xi}. T. M. Srinivasan, "What Are Subtle Energy Fields?" Excerpt from "A Subtle Energy Technology for Noise Reduction in Physical and Psychophysical Systems" [article online] available at <http://twm.co.nz/subtle.html>, Internet, accessed 3 February 2007.
- ^{xii}. Gloria Alvino, "The Human Energy Field in Relation to Science, Consciousness and Health, Parts 1 and 2" [article on-line] <http://www.twn.co.nz/energ.html> and <http://www.twm.co.nz/energy2.html>; Internet; accessed 8 August 2007. As the Institute for HeartMath notes, the current status of subtle energies is similar to that of electromagnetism 250 years ago in that "the effects could be seen but not directly measured." Institute of HeartMath, "Subtle Energy Research," [article on-line] <http://homepages.ihug.co.nz/~sai/SubtleEnergy.html>; Internet; accessed 22 July 2006: 1.
- ^{xiii}. Andreas Wehowsky, "Energy in Somatic Psychotherapy," lecture given at The First Dutch Symposium for Body-oriented Psychotherapy, Driebergen, 1998. [lecture on-line]; available from <http://www.asaseraives.pt/docs/energy.pdf>; Internet; accessed 27 February 2007.
- ^{xiv}. Eligio Stephen Gallegos, "Animal Imagery, the Cakra System and Psychotherapy," *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* 15, no. 2 (1983): 125.
- ^{xv}. Garret Yount, Yifang Qian, and Honglin Zhang, "Changing Perspectives on Healing Energy in Traditional Chinese Medicine," in *Consciousness & Healing: Integral Approaches to Mind-Body Medicine*, ed. Marilyn Schlitz, Tina Amorok, and Marc Micozzi (St. Louis, MO: Elsevier Churchill Livingstone, 2005): 421.
- ^{xvi}. Myeong Soo Lee, Young Hoon Rim, and Chang-won Kang, "Effects of External Qi-Therapy on Emotions, Electroencephalograms, and Plasma Cortisol," *International Journal of Neuroscience*, 114

(2004): 1494; and Chang, Sun Ok. "The Nature of Touch Therapy Related to Ki: Practitioners' Perspective," *Nursing and Health Sciences* 5 (2003): 104.

^{xvii}. Douglas Matzke, "Direct Awareness of Chi: Case Study," lecture presented at "Towards a Science of Consciousness," 1996 (Tuscon II), University of Arizona, [lecture on-line]; <http://www.matzkefamily.net/doug/papers/tuscon2b.html>; Internet; accessed 10 August 2007, 1-2. (page numbers)

^{xviii}. Ted Kaptchuk, *The Web That Has No Weaver: Understanding Chinese Medicine* (Chicago: Congdon and Weed, 1983), 35-36.

^{xix}. Tart, "Aikido and the Concept of Ki," 340-343.

^{xx}. Christopher Hills, "Is Kundalini Real?" in *Kundalini: Evolution and Enlightenment*, ed. John White (St. Paul, MN: Paragon House, 1990), 106-119.

^{xxi}. Haridas Chaudhari, "The Psychophysiology of Kundalini," in *Kundalini: Evolution and Enlightenment*, 62-63. Chaudhari gives no definition for his term 'transpersonal superconscious sense modalities.'

^{xxii}. Lee Sanella, "Kundalini: Classical and Clinical" in *Spiritual Emergency: When Personal Transformation Becomes a Crisis*, ed. Stanislav Grof and Christina Grof (New York: Jeremy Tarcher/Putnam, 1989), 99-108.

^{xxiii}. Eden, with Feinstein, *Energy Medicine*, 2-3.

^{xxiv}. Bruce Burger, *Esoteric Anatomy: The Body as Consciousness* (Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books, 1998), 7.

^{xxv}. William Collinge, "Subtle Energy: Basic Principles" excerpted from *Subtle Energy: Awakening to the Unseen forces in Our Lives* (New York: Warner Books, Inc., 1998); [excerpt on-line]; <http://www.healthy.net/collinge/basic.htm>; Internet; accessed 7 September 2004.

^{xxvi}. Caroline Myss, *Anatomy of the Spirit: The Seven Stages of Power and Healing* (New York: Harmony Books, 1996), 33-34.

^{xxvii}. Bruyere, *Wheels of Light*, 18.

^{xxviii}. Dyak, *The Voice Dialogue Facilitators Handbook*, 74.

^{xxix}. Myss, *Anatomy of the Spirit*, 69.

^{xxx}. Dyak, *The Voice Dialogue Facilitators Handbook*, 74.

^{xxxi}. Louchakova and Warner, "Via Kundalini," 126 and 137.

^{xxxii}. Wilber, "Are the Chakras Real?" 126-128. Exquisite visual images of subtle body anatomy can be found in work of Alex Grey. See Alex Grey, *Sacred Mirrors: The Visionary Art of Alex Grey* (Rochester Vermont: Inner Traditions International, 1990), especially the plates entitled "Psychic Energy System," "Spiritual Energy System," "Universal Mind Lattice," and "The Void/Clear Light."

^{xxxiii}. Reber, *Penguin Dictionary of Psychology*, 418.

^{xxxiv}. Calvin Hall, *Primer in Freudian Psychology* (Cleveland, OH: World Publishing Co., 1954),

^{xxxv}. Wilhelm.Reich, "Glossary," in *Selected Writings: An Introduction to Orgonomy* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1973), xx.

^{xxxvi}. Ibid., 188.

^{xxxvii}. Jean A. Metzker and Geoffrey Leigh, "A Short-term Longitudinal Study of Energy Fields in Infants and Young Children," *Subtle Energies and Energy Medicine* 15, no. 2 (2004): 140.

^{xxxviii}. Louchakova and Warner, "Via Kundalini," 126 and 130. Tiller also attributes the awakening of an awareness of subtle energy and subtle body experiences to the meditative cultivation of concentration. Tiller, *Science and Human Transformation*, 63 and 177.

^{xxxix}. Brennan, "Possible Physics of the Human Energy Field."

^{xl}. Bruyere, *Wheels of Light*, 96.

^{xli}. Marie Carlsson, personal communication to Gary Buck, 23 March 2007. Carlsson is the author of "Kundalini and the Bonnie Method of GIM (Guided Imagery and Music)," *Journal of the Association for Music and Imagery* 8 (2001-2002): 35-55. Tiller expresses a similar view when he writes that muscle proprioception is the physical body's link to subtle energy. Tiller, *Science and Human Transformation*, 132.

^{xlii}. Eden, with Feinstein, *Energy Medicine*, 43-44.

^{xliii}. Bruyere, *Wheels of Light*, 76.

^{xliv}. Ibid., 69. This view is quite similar to my own experience of the subtle energy dimension of sensory experience. However Bruyere does not elaborate what happens when energy is drained from the field at the heart. I suggest that my subtle energy description of Dependent Origination depicts what happens next. See Appendix 13, 295f.

^{xlv}. Bruyere, *Wheels of Light*, 76. My own experience and view is that both are true. The creative energy that structures our perception enters from below and has its source in the planet we live on while another energy, which tends to destructure experience enters from above and has a much vaster source.

^{xlvi}. Yan Xin, "Dr. Yan Xin on Scientific Qigong Research," [article on-line]; http://www.twm.co.nz/DrYan_qi.htm; Internet; accessed 8 August 2007.

^{xlvii}. Hunt, *Infinite Mind*, 21. These included electroencephalography (EEG - measurements of the brain's electrical activity), electromyography (EMG - measurements of the electrical activity of muscles) and electrocardiography (EKG - measurements of the heart's electrical activity).

^{xlviii}. Ibid., 22.

^{xlix}. Ibid., 29.

¹. An electromagnetic field is the combined effect of two fields generated by a charged particle: and electric field generated by the particle when stationary and a magnetic field generated by the particle in motion. From the view of classical physics, fields are continuous and move like waves while quantum theory requires fields to be particular, specifically photons, which transfer energy in discrete packets. Electromagnetic fields are one of the four natural forces currently recognized by physics. *Wikipedia: The Free Encyclopedia*, entry entitled "Electromagnetic Field" [encyclopedia on-line] http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Electromagnetic_field; Internet: accessed 10 October 2007.

^{li}. Ibid., 30-33. Aura readers observing subjects in the Mu Room were able to confirm reports in the literature that electromagnetic energy enters the body through acupuncture points while also adding that it flows through the connective tissue (tissue whose main known function is to hold together and support organs and other tissues). Note the connection between this observation and the perspective presented by Ho in the section on Western approaches to consciousness above.

^{lii}. Oschman, "What is Healing Energy? Part Three," 183. Oschman also offers clear support for Ho's theory. See 187, caption for Fig. 5 and 190.

^{liii}. Hunt, *Infinite Mind*, 20. Hunt also notes that energy fields around living organisms are active while those around inanimate objects are not.

^{liv}. Tiller, *Science and Human Transformation*, 106-107. Tiller lists the autonomic nervous system, acupuncture points and meridians, and the chakra system as examples of specific antennas associated with the human body. He suggests that different human body antennas serve different layers of the spectrum of electromagnetic radiation which in turn Tiller relates to the different layers of the subtle body depicted in the Indian cosmology. Tiller writes that antennas have different electromagnetic fields associated with them, both near fields and larger, broader fields. He suggests that the near fields constitute the human aura. Tiller notes that the presence throughout the body of neurohormones and neurotransmitters that are electromagnetically sensitive is another way in which the whole body is involved with subtle energies. (Although electromagnetic fields are among those measurable by science and so not technically subtle energies, the body's capacity to sense them would be a capacity more subtle than our ordinary sense capacities.) See pages 107-108, 127-128 and 166. Oschman concurs in this view that the human body functions as an antenna. See Oschman, "What is Healing Energy?: Part Three," 187, caption for Fig. 5 and 190.

^{lv}. Tiller, *Science and Human Transformation*, 121-127. Also see pages 76-78 for examples of the mandala-like imagery to which Tiller refers.

^{lvi}. Ibid., 4.

^{lvii}. Ibid., 10.

^{lviii}. Ibid., 14. Ernest Pecci describes Tiller's overall theory as depicting the universe as a lattice-like network along which are conveyed wave-like patterns generated by superluminary (traveling faster than the speed of light), subliminal subtle energies. Ernest Pecci, Foreword to *Science and Human Transformation*, Tiller, xiii-xix. This view of a universal lattice is reminiscent of the Buddhist and Hindu concept of Indra's Net. See Francis Cook, *Hua-Yen Buddhism: The Jewel Net of Indra*. (Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, 1977), 1-20. Qigong is a Chinese system for "physical, and mental training for health, martial arts, and self-enlightenment." *Wikipedia: The Free Encyclopedia*. entry for "qigong." [encyclopedia online]; <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Qigong>; accessed June 30, 2010.

^{lix}. Wilber, "Are the Chakras Real?" 122.

^{lx}. Ibid., 123-125. The awakening of the kundalini energy, Wilber says, is a process which undoes this tyranny. See 126. Wilber's depiction includes the infant's Oedipal fantasy of sexual union with the mother as a way of overcoming the fear of death, an explanation which makes some sense if you are a male but does not work from the feminine perspective.

^{lxi}. Liedloff, *The Continuum Concept*, 151.

^{lxii}. Metzker, and Leigh. "A Short-term Longitudinal Study of Energy Fields in Infants," 138. Metzker and Leigh speculate that this developmental process may be due to a 1) the development of other means of communication with other beings and information gathering from the environment meaning less need for energetic communication and information gathering, 2) a shift in the infants understanding of

themselves away from an energetic understanding towards a self understanding based increasingly in thought and language, and/or 3) a response to the lack of support from the environment for energy experience as a part of reality. To me it also suggests a decrease in the degree of interconnectedness with the environment perhaps leading to a heightened feeling of separateness from it. Citing research on brain development documenting the effects of disuse on our mental capabilities, Tiller believes that subtle energy senses are lost through disuse during our early years but can be regained. Tiller, *Science and Human Transformation*, 147-149. His view could also be related to Metzker and Leigh's findings.

^{lxiii}. Ronald Mann, "Subtle Energy in the Therapeutic Relationship," *Complimentary Health Practice Review* 3, no.2 (1997): 67, 70. Mann lists acupuncture, Therapeutic Touch, and Reiki as examples.

^{lxiv}. Alvino, "The Human Energy Field, Part II."

^{lxv}. Louchakova and Warner, "Via Kundalini," 140.

^{lxvi}. Mark B. Woodhouse, "Energy Monism: A Solution to the Mind-Problem that Connects Science and Spirituality," *Network Review: Journal of the Scientific and Medical Network*. [journal on-line]; <http://scimednet.org/library/articles/9711301510.htm>; Internet; accessed 27 February 2007, 1.(page number)

^{lxvii}. *Ibid.*, 4.

^{lxviii}. Larry Dossey, "Energy Talk," *Network Review: Journal of the Scientific and Medical Network*, [journal on-line]; <http://scimednet.org/library/articles/9711301421.htm>; Internet; accessed 27 February 2007.

^{lxix}. Ken Wilber, "Toward a Comprehensive Theory of Subtle Energies," *Explore* 1, No. 4 (2005): 259-260.

^{lxx}. Christian de Quincey, "Language, Energy & Consciousness: Can Energy Talk Enlighten Us About the Mind," *Network Review: Journal of the Scientific and Medical Network*, [journal on-line] <http://scimednet.org/library/Articles/PCSdequincey.htm>; Internet; accessed 27 February 2007.

^{lxxi}. Louchakova and Warner, "Via Kundalini," 140.

^{lxxii}. *Ibid.*, 125, 139, and 141.

^{lxxiii} See Appendix 13, 295f.

^{lxxiv}. However as noted in the section on Developmental Psychology above, Mahler, et al., do tie boundary and subtle energy together when they implicate a reallocation of libido from an internal cathexis to and external cathexis in the emergence of the experience of a self-other boundary in the early months of a human infant's development.

^{lxxv}. Hayward, "Ecology and the Experience of Sacredness," 69-70.

^{lxxvi}. *Ibid.*, 69.

^{lxxvii}. *Ibid.*, 69-70. This passage summarizes the process described on these pages. Hayward then goes on to list some ways in which Western empirical science supports this view. (page 71) This description comes close to my own, though my experience suggests some differences in order and involves more details especially of the initial patterning resulting in the split into inner and outer. My own emphasis is on the nature of the patterning referred to, particularly its nature as subtle energy. See Appendix 13, 295-309.

^{lxxviii}. Ibid., 66. I have used the Sanskrit spelling, skhandha in place of the Pali *khandha* since in Buddhist vipassanā circles that is the more commonly used spelling. All other Buddhist words are in Pali or Tibetan.

^{lxxix}. Wangyal, *Healing with Form, Energy and Light*, 8. Although the Bön tradition predates the arrival of Indian Buddhism in Tibet from India and, as such, is not technically of the same Buddhist lineage, Bön does trace its own roots to Tonpa Sherab, a Buddha who predates Shakyamuni Buddha, the historical Buddha of our era. (See pages xix-xxii for a short history of Bön.) Its teachings and practices are very close to those of the Vajrayana Buddhist tradition in Tibet, especially Dzogchen or the Great Perfection, the highest teachings of the Nyingma school. As such, I have chosen to include Tenzin Wangyal's work in this Buddhist literature review.

^{lxxx}. Ibid., 8-9.

^{lxxxi}. Ibid., 9. Here again is another description that is close to my own experience and theory yet the particular details, especially about how the activity of energy gives rise to the split into subject and object, are again missing. But what is somewhat unusual about this particular description is that it offers a picture or image of repeated emergence of the sense-of-self or subject grounded in the activity of subtle energy, the focus of my own practice and research.

^{lxxxii}. Barth, *A Meditation Guide for Mahamudra*. See his "Appendix B: The Meaning of Mahamudra," the sub-section entitled "The Adventitious Stains of Ignorance and the Path of Liberation."

^{lxxxiii}. B. Alan Wallace, "Energy Dynamics," in *Life Positive*, (January 2006): 66. As a parallel concept Wallace offers the Western physics idea of the background vacuum, also described as imbued with infinite energy, the excitations of which produce the configurations of mass-energy we experience as the physical world. See Wallace, "External, Internal and Nondual Space." The Dudjom Lingpa quote is from Dudjom Lingpa, *The Vajra Essence: From the Matrix of Primordial Consciousness and Pure Appearances, a Tantra of the Self-Arisen Nature of Existence*, trans. by B Alan Wallace, (Ashland, OR: Mirror of Wisdom, 2004.) (This is a restricted text requiring that the recipient have received teachings, empowerment and a reading transmission from a qualified lama before being allowed to purchase. Though I have received such teachings from qualified lamas for other similar texts by Dudjom Lingpa, I have not received teachings on this particular text. As such I have not been able to get a copy to read for myself to confirm the quote and its context or to determine the exact page number in the text. However Wallace himself is the translator of this text and a highly respected Vajrayana Buddhist scholar and academic. As such it is quite unlikely that he would misquote or quote out of context from this text. And since this passage so eloquently makes Wallace's point, I have decided to include it without detailed reference to the source text.)

^{lxxxiv}. Wallace, "External, Internal, and Nondual Space."

^{lxxxv}. Dalai Lama, *A Flash of Lightning in the Dark of Night*, 172-173.

^{lxxxvi}. Wallace, "Energy Dynamics," 64.

^{lxxxvii}. Wangyal, *Healing with Form, Energy and Light*, 3-4. Emptiness being the underlying insubstantial nature of all experience, luminosity being the union of knowing and the appearances that are known, insubstantial luminosity is simply an expression which denotes the underlying unity of luminosity and emptiness, that is the underlying insubstantiality of luminosity.

^{lxxxviii}. Preece, *The Psychology of Buddhist Tantra*, 94-98.

^{lxxxix}. Vajradevi, "Vajrapani: Breaking Free," Wildmind Blog, July 29, 2008. <http://wildmind.org/blogs/n-practice/breaking-free/>; Internet; accessed May 18, 2009; *Wikipedia*, [encyclopedia on-line], <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Vajrapani>; Internet; accessed 27 November 2009, entry for "Vajrapani." The

other principle Mahayana Bodhisattvas are Avalokiteshvara, representing the perfection of compassion, and Manjushri, representing the perfection of wisdom. Mahayana Buddhism is the northern version of Buddhism primarily found in China, Korea, and Japan. Vajrayana Buddhism is generally considered to be a form of Mahayana Buddhism that is characteristic of Tibet, Nepal, Bhutan, Sikkim, and parts of India.

^{xc}. Wikipedia, entry for “Vajrapani.”

^{xc}_i. Vajradevi, “Vajrapani: Breaking Free,” 2.

^{xc}_{ii}. Ibid., 5.

^{xc}_{iii}. Vessantara, *Meeting the Buddhas: A Guide to Buddhas, Bodhisattvas, and Tantric Deities* (Birmingham, England: Windhorse Publications, 1993), 211.

^{xc}_{iv}. Rat Rattanayano, Ajahn. “Vipassana Meditation,” Baan Mae Sapok, Mae Win, Mae Wang, Chiang Mai, Thailand: Wat Tham Doi Tone, undated.[article on-line]; http://vimuttidhamma.org/article.php?subaction=showfull&id=1171598253&archive=&start_from=&ucat=3&; Internet; accessed 9 November 2008.

^{xc}_v. Ajahn Sucitto, “Samadhi Is Pure Enjoyment,” *Inquiring Mind: A Semiannual Journal of the Vipassana Community* 20, no. 2 (2004): 39.

^{xc}_{vi}. Ajahn Taniya. “Freeing Our Life Energy: An Interview with Ajahn Thaniya,” in *Inquiring Mind* 23, no. 2 (2007): 20.

^{xc}_{vii}. Ibid., 19 and 48.

^{xc}_{viii}. Mirka Knaster, “Senses Galore,” *Inquiring Mind: A Semiannual Journal of the Vipassana Community* 20, no. 2 (2004): 18-19.

^{xc}_{ix}. Ibid., 19.

^c. Ibid.

^{ci}. Preece, *The Psychology of Buddhist Tantra*, 91-92.

^{cii}. Wallace, “Energy Dynamics,” 65.

^{ciii}. Alan Wallace, “Scientific Mind, Buddhist Mind: An Interview with Alan Wallace,” interviewed by Margaret Cullen, *Inquiring Mind: A Semiannual Journal of the Vipassana Community* 20, no. 2 (2004): 22.

^{civ}. Wallace, “Energy Dynamics,” 64-65. Wallace goes on to say that it is the range of concentrated experience of the jhānas and the āruppas that give us access to realm of what he calls ‘pure forms,’ which he equates with the archetypes. 65-66.

^{cv}. Rat Rattanayano, “Vipassana Meditation.”

^{cvi}. Dalai Lama, *A Flash of Lightning in the Dark Sky*, 111.

^{cvi}_i. Wangyal, *Healing with Form, Energy and Light*, 9. Above he describes how subject-object consciousness emerges out of the nondual due to the activity of subtle energy.

^{cviii}. Fenner, "Nonduality and Therapy," 28. He goes on to note that psychotherapists who have cultivated this nondual quality can sense the presence of energy blocks in their clients by attending to the subtle energy activity in their own bodies. See page 41.

^{cix}. Wallace, "Energy Dynamica," 66.

^{cx}. Vajradevi, "Vajrapani: Breaking Free," 4-5.

^{cxii}. Hayward, "Ecology and the Experience of Sacredness," 74.

^{cxiii}. Joseph Campbell, *The Hero with a Thousand Faces* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1949), 258.

^{cxiiii}. Ibid.

^{cxv}. Ibid.

^{cxvi}. Ibid.

^{cxvii}. Ibid.

^{cxviii}. Ibid., 271-313.

^{cxviiii}. Laura Sewall, "The Skill of Ecological Perception," *Ecopsychology*, 209.

^{cxix}. Sewall, *Sight and Sensibility*, 16 and 29. Sewall writes that this quality is essential to the Aboriginal Dreamtime.

^{cxix}. Sewall, "The Skill of Ecological Perception," 202-203.

^{cxix}. Ibid., 209-210.

^{cxix}. Mindell, *Dreaming While Awake*, 19.

^{cxix}. Ibid., 11, 36. Lucidity is thus a parallel in some respects to Barfield's 'figuration.' However, while Mindell includes sense experience as an aspect of lucidity, for Barfield sense experience precedes figuration.

^{cxix}. Ibid., 17 and 59. As such, Dreaming involves participation with all sentient beings.

^{cxix}. Sussman, "The Empty Grail," 4 and 9.

^{cxix}. Ibid., 3 and 10-11.

^{cxix}. Ibid., 4. Again, Sussman's description of emptiness is very close to the use of this term in Vajrayana Buddhism.

^{cxix}. Peter Reason, "A Participatory Window," *Resurgence*, 168 (1998): 42-44; and Barfield, "Participation and Isolation," *The Rediscovery of Meaning*, 205.

^{cxix}. Albert Kreinheder, "Alchemy and the Subtle Body," *Psychological Perspectives* 6, no. 2 (1975): 135.

^{cxix}. James Hillman, *Re-Visioning Psychology* (New York: HarperCollins, 1975), 174.

^{cxxx}. Ibid., 141-142.

^{cxxxii}. Ibid., 142.

^{cxxxiii}. Mansfield and Spiegelman, "On the Physics and Psychology of the Transference," 196.

^{cxxxiv}. Schwartz-Salant, *The Mystery of Human Relationship*, 11-13. Schwartz-Salant notes that as an alchemical metaphor of transformation, the subtle body belies our ordinary experience and belief that we are separate from each other and have at our core some unchanging individual essence. This view of the self as interconnected with the rest of the universe and having no individual persisting aspect is consistent with the view of Vajrayana Buddhism.

^{cxxxv}. C. G. Jung, *Nietzsche's Zarathustra*, 441. Jung uses the analogy of sublimation from the physical sciences, the process by which a solid can be transformed directly into a gas, without first passing through a liquid phase, to suggest that it is possible to de-materialize or *subtilize* matter. Jung, *Nietzsche's Zarathustra*, 1067. This perspective resonates well with Michael Winn's Chinese alchemical perspective that "matter is spirit that is not yet reintegrated with the formless dimension of spirit." See Michael Winn, "Internal Alchemy with Michael Winn," interviewed by *The Empty Vessel* magazine, [interview on-line]; <http://www.cejournal.org/GRD/Alchemy.htm>; Internet; accessed 13 April 2007.

^{cxxxvi}. Ibid., 450. Note the similarity to Eden's and Bruyere's views in the lit review section on Subtle Energy above.

^{cxxxvii}. Mansfield and Spiegelman, "On the Physics and Psychology of the Transference," 196; Schwartz-Salant, *The Mystery of Human Relationship*, 96. Schwartz-Salant as well as Mansfield and Spiegelman find evidence for this notion of the subtle body in the experience of relationship, particularly in the dynamics of the psychotherapeutic transference/countertransference.. Schwartz-Salant nonetheless also acknowledges that for the alchemists, the subtle body was not a matter of interpersonal relationship but of simultaneously catalyzing changes in outer physical substances and the alchemist's own inner psychological being in the context of the relationship between a person and the material world. See Schwartz-Salant, *TheMystery of Human Relationships*, 29, and Mansfield and Spiegelman, "On the Physics of the Transference," ^{cxxxvii}.

^{cxxxviii}. Marie-Louise von Franz, *On Dreams and Death: A Jungian Interpretation* (Boston: Shambhala, 1987), 144.

^{cxxxix}. Jung, *Collected Works, Vol. 8*, 211.

^{cxl}. Washburn, *Embodied Spirituality*, 121, 216, and 219, respectively.

^{cxli}. Ibid., 69 and 209. Washburn calls this the *power of the Dynamic Ground*, defined as "the deep core of the psyche and seat of non-egoic psychic potentials."

^{cxlii}. Karen Jaenke and Kimmy Johnson. "Water and Stone: All of Nature Participates in Our Remembering," *ReVision* 21, no. 1 (1998): 31.

^{cxliii}. V. Walter Odajnyk, *Gathering the Light: A Psychology of Meditation* (Boston: Shambhala Publications, Inc., 1993), 48. Odajnyk thus seems to use the term 'consciousness' more in the sense of participatory consciousness.

^{cxliv}. V. Walter Odajnyk, "Meditation and Alchemy: Images of the Goal in East and West," *Psychological Perspectives: A Journal of Jungian Thought Integrating Psyche, Soul & Nature* 22, (1990): 55-71. Odajnyk describes the stages in this process and relates them to parallel stages in both Western alchemy and Jungian psychology, including equating this union with the Jungian notion of the Self.

-
- ^{cxlv}. Judith, *Eastern Body, Western Mind*, 9.
- ^{cxlvi}. C. G. Jung, "On Psychic Energy," *The Structure and Dynamics of the Psyche* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1960), 61-66.
- ^{cxlvii}. C. G. Jung, "Psychological Commentary on Kundalini Yoga," (Part 1), *Spring: An Annual of Archetypal Psychology and Jungian Thought*, (1975): 9-32. See Part 2, for Jung's misgivings about the higher chakras and Coward for a discussion of these misgivings in light of current understanding. H. G. Coward, "Jung and Kundalini," *Journal of Analytical Psychology*, 30 (1985): 381 and 383.
- ^{cxlviii}. Coward, "Jung and Kundalini," 383.
- ^{cxlix}. Marion Woodman and Elinor Dickson, *Dancing in the Flames: The Dark Goddess in the Transformation of Consciousness* (Boston: Shambhala, 1997), 71.
- ^{cl}. Washburn, *Embodied Spirituality*, 53, 70, 78, 83, and Michael Washburn, "Psychic Energy, Libido & Spirit: Three Energies or One?" *Personal Transformation*, [online journal] <http://www.personaltransformation.com/Washburn.html> (2002): accessed Dec. 13, 2006. This view supports my own perspective that subtle energy and its activity can be directly perceived. However, I would add that that one of the transformative impacts of spirit is to sharpen one's introspective perspicacity such that it becomes possible to directly perceive the canalization of Washburn's other two energies, psychic energy and libido, as well, rather than only their effects. I suspect that this is what Mindell is pointing towards when he describes his Dreaming.
- ^{cli}. Stephen Aizenstat, "Jungian Psychology and the World Unconscious," *Ecopsychology*, 94.
- ^{clii}. M. Esther Harding, *The 'I' and the 'Not-I': A Study in the Development of Consciousness*, (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1965), 136.
- ^{cliii}. Solomon, "Archetypal Psychology and Object Relations Theory," 313.
- ^{cliv}. Jung, *Collected Works*, Vol. 8, "On the Nature of the Psyche," par. 417.
- ^{clv}. Naomi Goldenberg, "Archetypal Theory After Jung," *Spring: An Annual of Archetypal Psychology and Jungian Thought* (1975): 202. Here Goldenberg's notion is reminiscent of Jung's division of the psychic energy pole of his energy spectrum into a secondary polarized range from more purely energetic expressions, on the one hand, to imagery, on the other.
- ^{clvi}. Michael Winn, "Daoist Internal Alchemy: A Language for Communicating with Nature's Intelligence," paper presented at the National Conference of Daoist Scholars and Adepts, Vashon Island, WA, May, 2001, [paper on-line]; <http://www.healingtaousa.com/pdf/taoalchemy.pdf>; Internet; accessed 23 November 2007.
- ^{clvii}. Odajnyk, *Gathering the Light*, 186-187.
- ^{clviii}. Ibid.
- ^{clix}. Ibid., 95.
- ^{clx}. Aizenstat, "Jungian Psychology and the World Unconscious," 95.
- ^{clxi}. Ibid., 96. Aizenstadt depicts the world unconscious as the inner natures of the world's organic and inorganic phenomena. Of course, from a Western scientific perspective, the inner nature of matter is energy. Aizenstadt argues our ecological relationship to the rest of nature has an importance similar to that

of our relationships with other humans and that it should be included in the field of psychology. This shift necessarily involves our direct sensory experience of the physical world we live in.

^{clxii}. Dennis, *Embrace of the Daimon*, 69.

^{clxiii}. Jeannette Armstrong, "Keepers of the Earth," *Ecopsychology*, 320.

^{clxiv}. *Ibid.*, 322.

^{clxv}. *Ibid.* On the same page, she further notes that this spirit self "teaches that this old part of us can 'hear/interpret' all knowledge being spoken by all things that surround us, including our own bodies, in order to bring new knowledge into existence."

^{clxvi}. Anita Barrows, "The Ecopsychology of Child Development," *Ecopsychology*, 106.

^{clxvii}. *Ibid.*, 103.

^{clxxviii}. *Ibid.*, 106-107.

^{clxxix}. *Ibid.*, 108.

^{clxxx}. *Ibid.*

^{clxxxi}. James Hillman, "A Psyche the Size of the World: A Psychological Foreword," *Ecopsychology*, xvii.

^{clxxxii}. *Ibid.*, xix.

^{clxxxiii}. Sewall, *Sight and Sensibility*, 11.

^{clxxxiv}. Dennis, *Embrace of the Daimon*, 22. However historically, Dennis says, more emphasis has been placed on the image, resulting in neglect of the subtle sensation "backdrop," of the imagery. See 140.

^{clxxxv}. *Ibid.*, 77.

^{clxxxvi}. James Hillman, "Image-Sense," *Spring: An Annual of Archetypal Psychology and Jungian Thought*, (1979): 134.

^{clxxxvii}. *Ibid.*, 135-136. Hillman uses the term *third eye*, a common synonym for the sixth of the seven chakras. In other respects, his perspective is reminiscent of Mindell's 'luminosity' or the subtle perceptual capacities that Sussman attributes to the seasoned seeker of the Grail.

^{clxxxviii}. Mindell, *Dreaming While Awake*, 23-24.

^{clxxxix}. John P. Conger, *Jung & Reich: The Body as Shadow* (Berkeley: North Atlantic Books, 1988), 197.

^{clxxx}. Mansfield and Spiegelman, "On the Physics and Psychology of the Transference," 196. This capacity Mansfield and Spiegelman contrast with the psyche, which "functioning through symbolic intuition is the organ of perception of archetypes." See Chapter Five below for a discussion of the relationship between subtle energy and the archetypes which eschews this dichotomy between the interactive field, on the one hand, and the archetypes, on the other.

^{clxxxxi}. Schwartz-Salant, *The Mystery of Human Relationship*, 68, 74, and 96. See Chapter Five below for more on this topic by Schwartz-Salant.

-
- ^{clxxxii}. Dennis, *Embrace of the Daimon*, 110.
- ^{clxxxiii}. Mindell, *Dreaming While Awake*, 11, 16, and 27.
- ^{clxxxiv}. Sewall, “The Skill of Ecological Perception,” *Ecopsychology*, 204.
- ^{clxxxv}. Schwartz-Salant, *The Mystery of Human Relationship*, 223.
- ^{clxxxvi}. Mansfield and Spiegelman, “On the Physics and Psychology of the Transference.” 186.
- ^{clxxxvii}. Odajnyk, *Gathering the Light*, 61-63. For a comment relative to my own understanding of this particular layer of samādhi, see Appendix 13, 292 and 294, note 23.